

# **EXHIBIT S**

**In The Matter Of:**

*ASARCO, LLC*

*v.*

*NL INDUSTRIES, INC.*

---

*BROWN, FRANKLIN, 30(b)(6) - Vol. 1*

*November 8, 2013*

---

**MERRILL CORPORATION**

**Legalink, Inc.**

20750 Ventura Boulevard  
Suite 205  
Woodland Hills, CA 91364  
Phone: 818.593.2300  
Fax: 818.593.2301

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30 (b) (6) - 11/8/2013

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MISSOURI  
EASTERN DIVISION

ASARCO, LLC,	)	CASE NO. 4:11-CV-00864 JAR
	)	
PLAINTIFF,	)	
	)	30 (b) (6)
vs.	)	VIDEOTAPE DEPOSITION
	)	OF FRANKLIN BROWN
NL INDUSTRIES, INC.,	)	
ET AL.,	)	
	)	
DEFENDANTS.	)	

VIDEOTAPE DEPOSITION OF FRANKLIN BROWN, taken  
before Mary Lou Harmon, RPR, CRR, CSR(IA), CCR, General  
Notary Public within and for the State of Nebraska,  
beginning at 9:00 a.m., on the 8th day of November 2013,  
at Cassem, Tierney, Adams, Gotch & Douglas, Suite 302,  
9290 West Dodge Road, Omaha, Nebraska.

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

## 1 A P P E A R A N C E S

## 2 FOR THE PLAINTIFF:

3 MR. GREGORY EVANS  
4 INTEGER LAW CORPORATION  
5 633 West Fifth Street  
6 Floor 67  
7 Los Angeles, CA 90071  
8 (213)892-4488 FAX(213)627-2579  
9 gevens@integerlegal.com

## 10 FOR DEFENDANT UNION PACIFIC RAILROAD COMPANY:

11 MS. CAROLYN L. MCINTOSH  
12 PATTON BOGGS, LLP  
13 1801 California Street  
14 Suite 4900  
15 Denver, CO 80202  
16 (303)894-6127 FAX(303)894-9239  
17 cmcintosh@pattonboggs.com

18 MR. NORTON A. COLVIN, JR.  
19 COLVIN, CHANEY, SAENZ & RODRIGUEZ, LLP  
20 1201 East Van Buren Street  
21 P.O. Box 2155  
22 Brownsville, TX 78522  
23 (956)542-7441 FAX(956)541-2170  
24 na.colvin@rcclaw.com

25 FOR THE DEFENDANT ANSCHUTZ MINING CORPORATION:  
MR. WINSTON E. CALVERT (via telephone)  
ARMSTRONG TEASDALE, LLP  
7700 Forsyth Boulevard  
Suite 1800  
St. Louis, MO 63105  
(314)259-4752 FAX(314)552-4883  
wcalvert@armstrongteasdale.com

FOR THE DEFENDANT NL INDUSTRIES:  
MR. JOEL L. HERZ (via telephone)  
LAW OFFICES OF JOEL L. HERZ  
3573 E. Sunrise Drive  
Suite 215  
Tucson, AZ 85718  
(520)529-8080  
joel@joelherz.com

Also Present: Mr. John Powers (via telephone)  
Mr. Jay Rollins - Videographer

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1	I N D E X	
2		PAGE
3	CASE CAPTION .....	1
4	APPEARANCES .....	2
5	DEPOSITION INDEX .....	3-4
6	TESTIMONY AND PROCEEDINGS .....	5
7	COURT REPORTER NOTARY PUBLIC CERTIFICATE .....	184
8	DIRECT EXAMINATION	
9	BY MR. EVANS: .....	11
10	EXHIBITS:	MARKED
11	EXHIBIT A. Objection to Notice .....	9
12	Exhibit 26. Notice .....	21
13	EXHIBITS PREVIOUSLY MARKED:	IDENTIFIED
14	Exhibit 1.UP's Answer to Complaint .....	70
15	Exhibit 2.Chronological History .....	71
16	Exhibit 3.Union Pacific in Missouri .....	78
17	Exhibit 4.NewFields' Report .....	79
18	Exhibit 5.Photograph .....	107
19	Exhibit 6.Photographs .....	109
20	Exhibit 7.Various Articles .....	111
21	Exhibit 8.Railway Age Gazette Article .....	112
22	Exhibit 9.Public Service Commission .....	141
23	Exhibit 10.State Geologist Report .....	161
24	Exhibit 11.Maps .....	166
25	Exhibit 13.Letter Dated 11/30/00 .....	176
	Exhibit 14.Agreement and Covenant .....	176
	Exhibit 15.Photographs .....	130

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30 (b) (6) - 11/8/2013

1	Exhibit 16.Letter Dated 12/5/03 .....	177
2	Exhibit 17.Map .....	182
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1 BY MR. EVANS:

2 Q. Did you know at the time that you were  
3 roadmaster that ore concentrate had high levels of lead  
4 in it?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And you knew at that time that the company  
7 was -- company was operating open hopper cars with lead  
8 concentrate in it?

9 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
10 is vague.

11 THE WITNESS: Yes.

12 BY MR. EVANS:

13 Q. How fast did those trains go?

14 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
15 is vague.

16 THE WITNESS: They run probably 50 miles  
17 an hour.

18 BY MR. EVANS:

19 Q. Uncovered?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Describe lead ore concentrate.

22 A. Well, it's a real fine material that, you  
23 know, is loaded into hopper cars.

24 Q. Do you know how many tons of ore concentrate  
25 Union Pacific or the predecessor railroads transported

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1           A.    Yes.  We had to block it, because we'd do  
2   things that make it unsafe to run trains, so...

3           Q.    Did you ever perform maintenance on the  
4   mainlines without obtaining a block such that rail  
5   traffic could go through?

6                   MS. MCINTOSH:  Objection:  Beyond the  
7   scope of the topics.

8                   THE WITNESS:  No, not really, no.

9   BY MR. EVANS:

10          Q.    And when I say "block," I'm referring to a red  
11   block?

12          A.    I know what you're talking about.

13          Q.    Did you ever observe any derailments on the  
14   railroad?

15                   When I say "railroad," I'm referring to UP and  
16   all the predecessor companies, okay?

17          A.    Yes.

18          Q.    Did you ever observe any derailments in the  
19   southeast mining area?

20                   MS. MCINTOSH:  Objection to the extent  
21   that you've incorporated all the predecessors, it calls  
22   for a legal conclusion.  It's beyond the scope of the  
23   topics.

24   BY MR. EVANS:

25          Q.    Go ahead, sir.



FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. What kind of derailments did you observe?

3 A. Well, most generally derailment of cars, you  
4 know, that it's either derailed off the track or turned  
5 over or whatever, you know.

6 Q. Did you ever observe derailments where cars  
7 actually turned over?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Did you ever observe derailments in the  
10 southeast mining area where cars turned over and  
11 materials from those cars spilled out?

12 A. I've had materials spilled out, yes.

13 Q. What was the main material that was hauled in  
14 the southeast mining area?

15 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
16 is vague.

17 BY MR. EVANS:

18 Q. In your experience on the railroad?

19 A. Most of -- most of the material was iron ore  
20 or lime or concentrate.

21 Q. Lead ore?

22 A. Lead ore.

23 Q. Does Union Pacific today have active lines in  
24 Missouri?

25 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection: Beyond the

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1 scope of the topics.

2 THE WITNESS: Yes.

3 BY MR. EVANS:

4 Q. What are those lines called, do you know?

5 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
6 is vague.

7 THE WITNESS: Well, we still got the  
8 mainlines that runs through a lot of places. We got  
9 sidings and branch lines.

10 BY MR. EVANS:

11 Q. Branch lines. Let's talk about branch lines.

12 Do you have -- does Union Pacific have branch  
13 lines running today in SEMO?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Do you know what company operated those branch  
16 lines before Union Pacific?

17 A. Missouri Illinois operated most of them.

18 (Exhibit No. 1 previously  
19 marked in prior depositions.)

20 BY MR. EVANS:

21 Q. I show you what's been marked as Exhibit 1.

22 Have you ever seen that document before?

23 This is Union Pacific's answer to ASARCO's  
24 second amended complaint.

25 A. I don't know as I did. No, I don't think so.

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Did any of the railroads that you worked for  
3 operate in that county?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Which railroad?

6 A. Well, it was originally the Missouri Illinois  
7 Railroad operated in it, and eventually Missouri Pacific  
8 merged with them.

9 Q. And eventually the Missouri Pacific merged  
10 with Union Pacific?

11 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection: Calls for a  
12 legal conclusion.

13 THE WITNESS: Yes.

14 BY MR. EVANS:

15 Q. Let me show you a statement then on Page 3 of  
16 Exhibit 4 regarding railroad construction.

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. Do you agree that the railroad in this area,  
19 St. Francois County, that the railroad grade was  
20 constructed using the cut-and-fill method?

21 Do you agree with that statement?

22 A. I don't know -- I don't know -- I don't know  
23 that, because I wasn't there when it was constructed.

24 Q. Do you agree with the statement that the final  
25 cover consisted of 12 to 18 inches of chat, as indicated

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1 on Page 3 of Exhibit 4?

2 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
3 is vague.

4 THE WITNESS: It was -- the final 12 to  
5 18 inches was constructed of ballast, yes.

6 BY MR. EVANS:

7 Q. You agree with the statement that the chat  
8 provided a granular, easily handled, well-drained  
9 aggregate for bedding the wooden cross ties?

10 Do you agree with that statement?

11 MS. MCINTOSH: I object that the question  
12 is vague, and that the document speaks for itself.

13 THE WITNESS: The chat -- the chat that  
14 is referred to was -- it was a good bedding at the time,  
15 but it was not -- later on years it was not. Chat was  
16 easy to walk on was really the only good thing that it  
17 was ever used for.

18 BY MR. EVANS:

19 Q. Do you agree with the statement on Page 3 of  
20 Exhibit 4 concerning the railroad construction in  
21 St. Francois County that besides side slopes, relatively  
22 thin chat ballast was observed in flat cut sections  
23 through hills and where the grade was constructed on  
24 existing topography?

25 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30 (b) (6) - 11/8/2013

1 is vague; compound.

2 BY MR. EVANS:

3 Q. Does Union Pacific agree with that statement?

4 A. On that railroad chat was used on most all of  
5 it prior to our merging with them.

6 Q. When you say "most all of it," what are you  
7 referring to?

8 A. Most all of the Missouri Illinois Railroad  
9 chat was used on it.

10 Q. When you say before we merged with them, what  
11 company?

12 A. Before Union -- before Missouri Pacific merged  
13 with them.

14 Q. Do you agree with the statement on Page 3 of  
15 Exhibit 4 that fill was used across low-lying areas at  
16 stream crossings, and where it was necessary to  
17 construct ramps to crest a divide?

18 Do you agree with that statement on behalf of  
19 Union Pacific?

20 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
21 is vague and compound. The document speaks for itself.

22 THE WITNESS: As I said a while ago, I  
23 don't know what all the fill was built out of before I  
24 took it over.

25

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1 BY MR. EVANS:

2 Q. Do you know whether the fill was built out of  
3 mining waste?

4 A. Not to my knowledge.

5 Q. In fact, you don't know what all the fill was  
6 made of?

7 A. Not all down through it, no, I don't.

8 Q. Do you agree with the statement at Page 3 at  
9 Exhibit 4 that chat was used almost exclusively where  
10 large quantities of fill were needed to meet grade  
11 requirements?

12 Do you agree with that statement?

13 A. There was a lot of it used, I know that, yes.

14 Q. A lot of it used where, sir?

15 A. Well, there was a lot of it used as fill  
16 material and as ballast too on the Missouri Illinois  
17 Railroad.

18 Q. When the Missouri owned those railroads, do  
19 you know where that chat came from?

20 A. No, because it was built before my time.

21 Q. Did the Missouri Pacific acquire the  
22 Mississippi River and Bonne Terre Railroad?

23 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection: Calls for a  
24 legal conclusion.

25 THE WITNESS: That was -- yes, that was

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30 (b) (6) - 11/8/2013

1 you didn't understand?

2 A. Ask it again.

3 Q. Do you know what Union Pacific constructed --  
4 Union Pacific predecessor railroads used to construct  
5 the railroads next to water that you testified about?

6 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
7 is vague, it's beyond the scope of the topics. It also  
8 calls for a legal conclusion.

9 THE WITNESS: I don't know -- I don't  
10 know all the way to the bottom of the railroad, no, what  
11 it was constructed out of.

12 BY MR. EVANS:

13 Q. All right. Thank you. And you weren't there  
14 when they were constructed; right?

15 A. That's right, I wasn't there.

16 Q. Okay. Do you know whether any of the  
17 materials that were used to construct the railroads fell  
18 into any of the water that you've described, the rivers  
19 or the streams or the -- off the bridges?

20 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
21 is vague and compound.

22 THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sure that there is  
23 some that may have washed into it, you know, during the  
24 rains, heavy rains and --

25

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30 (b) (6) - 11/8/2013

1 BY MR. EVANS:

2 Q. Floods?

3 A. Floods, what have you, yes.

4 Q. What rivers are you talking about where that  
5 material you're sure washed into?

6 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
7 mischaracterized Mr. Brown's testimony, and was vague.

8 THE WITNESS: Mostly -- mostly we run  
9 along the Mississippi River, we run along Bay River, we  
10 run along Black River, and several creeks.

11 BY MR. EVANS:

12 Q. Which might include Turkey Creek?

13 A. Could.

14 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection: Calls for  
15 speculation.

16 THE WITNESS: Could be.

17 BY MR. EVANS:

18 Q. In terms of the maintenance-of-way, one of the  
19 reasons that you need to -- was one of the reasons that  
20 you needed to bring in fill was because the material  
21 that was on these railroads would erode; is that right?

22 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection. The question  
23 is vague.

24 THE WITNESS: Some erosion. More so --  
25 more so washouts and stuff like that.



FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1 BY MR. EVANS:

2 Q. What's a washout?

3 A. It's -- a washout is whenever you get real  
4 heavy, heavy rains and floods, it washes the ballast, to  
5 dump everything out from under the track.

6 (Exhibit No. 15 previously  
7 marked in prior depositions.)

8 BY MR. EVANS:

9 Q. Let me show you what's been marked as  
10 Exhibit 15, Mr. Brown.

11 Can you tell, looking at Exhibit 15, including  
12 the color photograph that might give you a better view,  
13 what -- whether there is railroad track on top of that  
14 hill?

15 A. I do see -- I do see some rail and ties on top  
16 of there, yes.

17 Q. And when you talk about washout -- excuse me.  
18 When you talk about erosion, do you see that gap  
19 underneath the railroad and railroad ties depicted on  
20 kind of the right-hand corner of Exhibit 15?

21 MS. MCINTOSH: I object to the form of  
22 the question. It's vague and compound.

23 THE WITNESS: Yes, I see it.

24 BY MR. EVANS:

25 Q. Does that look like erosion to you based on

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1 your experience on the Union Pacific?

2 MS. MCINTOSH: I object that the question  
3 is vague.

4 THE WITNESS: It could be erosion, or it  
5 could be a washout.

6 BY MR. EVANS:

7 Q. Thank you. But that's what, in your  
8 railroading experience, a washout or erosion looks like?

9 MS. MCINTOSH: Objection: Calls for  
10 speculation, and the question is vague.

11 THE WITNESS: Yes.

12 BY MR. EVANS:

13 Q. Can I ask you, please, to circle the area on  
14 Exhibit 15 on the color photo that you've been referring  
15 to as an area that illustrates what a railroad washout  
16 or erosion looks like?

17 MS. MCINTOSH: I object to the form of  
18 the question.

19 THE WITNESS: [Complies.]

20 BY MR. EVANS:

21 Q. Can you put your initials next to the circle  
22 on the bottom, please?

23 A. [Complies.]

24 Q. Thank you, Mr. Brown.

25 Did you become familiar with any of the

FRANKLIN BROWN, 30(b)(6) - 11/8/2013

1 CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

2 I, Mary Lou Harmon, a Certified Shorthand  
3 Reporter, hereby certify that the witness in the  
4 foregoing deposition was by me duly sworn to tell the  
5 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in the  
6 within-entitled cause;

7 That said deposition was taken down in  
8 shorthand by me, a disinterested person, at the time and  
9 place therein stated, and that the testimony of the said  
10 witness was thereafter reduced to typewriting, by  
11 computer, under my direction and supervision;

12 That before completion of the deposition,  
13 review of the transcript was requested. Any changes  
14 made by the deponent (and provided to the reporter)  
15 during the period allowed are appended hereto.

16 I further certify that I am not of counsel or  
17 attorney for either or any of the parties to the said  
18 deposition, nor in any way interested in the event of  
19 this cause, and that I am not related to any of the  
20 parties thereto.

21 DATED: November 13, 2013

22  
23 MARY LOU HARMON, RPR, CRR  
CSR NO. 0112

24 My commission expires:  
25